

## Unit 5

### Conclusion and Discussion

The knowledge capturing of the best practices and achievement factors in NIT's recruiting system concluded in 2 parts: 1) the best practices and achievement factors of NIT and 2) the policy recommendation for the personnel management in the institutes that provides new teaching and learning or bilateral education system in Thailand. Details are as follow.

#### 1) The best practices in NIT's recruiting system

A result of the synthesis of NIT's personnel management revealed the best practices of NIT's recruiting system and its lecturers' specification. The findings revealed that NIT's excellent recruiting system included 4 components: principles and important concepts; recruiting process; channel of recruitment and public relations; and recruiting method. Besides, each college or campus of NIT had been able to independently conduct its recruitment process, set the selection criteria, and make the decision to select their own lecturers. NIT's lecturers' specification was set up consisting of 5 core criteria: educational level and background; reputation, interests, attitude, vision, and belief; skills and experiences; academic and research publication; and other qualification requiring by each college. Additionally, this best practice also linked to other system influencing the recruiting system: the recruitment for promotion system, the value system, and the incentive system summarizing as follows.

#### *Recruiting system and lecturers' specification*

All NIT's colleges were able to set the criteria and procedures for recruiting and selecting their own lecturers. The key components in the recruitment process were the following: principles and important concepts; channel of recruitment and PR; recruit methods; and lecturer qualifications.

Principles and important concepts of its recruitment process was the transparency and free from interference. The process was under the responsibility of each college personnel section, General Affair's Division. The Personnel Committee was responsible for the selection process.

Channel of recruitment and PR involves both paper and online jobs posting channel. Paper job posting had been done through colleges' or universities publication, Academic Society's HP, Engineering Associations, and companies. Online job posting has been done through some main websites such as Japan Research Career Information Network (JREC-IN) and NIT Headquarters' HP.

Recruit methods divided into 2 parts: documents screening and the interview. Three criteria were attitude, content, and appropriateness with 15 points each. Total was 45. The final selection had made by the president.

Lecturers' specification consisted of educational background and education level, reputation, interest, attitude, belief, skills and experiences, publications such as academic research and other specific requirements from each college.

#### *Recruitment for Promotion System*

Career advancement in teaching position of NIT depended on the appropriateness of instructors' attributes and potential. They were age, educational background, knowledge, abilities, and skills in performing various tasks. Position placement of instructors' levels was set in the following order.

1. Assistant Professor
2. Lecturer
3. Associate Professor
4. Professor

Recruiting for the promotion process was very close to the recruitment of new instructors. A candidate who would like to be promoted had to submit their documents for evaluation. Important document was the recommendation letter from the professor in each department or president. They had to hold a master or doctoral degree with explicit performance achievement. The committee members would consider 4 items: academic achievement; research achievement; contribution to the community; educational management with vary scoring by position. Recruitment process divided into 3 stages; recruitment announcement; document and qualification screening; and interviews, presentations, and trial class, then, the appropriate person would be selected for promotion.

### *Value system*

Value system of NIT was an important factor contributing to the success in all aspects of the organization. NIT's staff valued the outstanding features of its education system, college or campus networks, alumni network, academic network, community network, and company or enterprise network in and outside the country. Explicit rules of the institute including clear structure and personnel function defined by the college. NIT's staff also valued their own quality standards and other personnel through belief, value, discipline, devotion, willingness, loyalty, relationship, attitude toward problem-solving.

### *Incentives System for Retention*

NIT's policy had emphasized on the maintaining of quality staff until retirement. Therefore, each NIT's college aimed to promote staff motivation in various fields to create and empower their morale. They provided the incentives on development, payment, research grants, benefits, and welfares.

Incentives on development were mostly from government budget allocating to the college for the faculty development, lecturers' further study, research, training, and exchange programs. It operated both domestically and internationally. In addition, NIT intended to create the training system together with creating the employment system for all teachers.

In terms of incentives on payment, research grants; benefits; and welfares, college lecturers received a high salary according to their educational background and ability. They could also get higher salaries when they were promoted. In addition, NIT also offered extra payment from regular salaries for ones who excellently performed in every academic year.

In terms of benefits and welfare, NIT's lecturers in each college received the same benefits and welfare when compared to other state employees. The Institute had also allocated more funds and time to conduct research when compared to company or enterprise staff.

In terms of welfare, NIT had organized various projects such as savings, a special program for special festivals, and the benefits of leave with a salary.

## 2) Achievement Factors NIT's personnel management

The results of the synthesis of NIT's personnel management's achievement factors were divided into two parts: external and internal.

### *External Factors*

Achievement factors of NIT's personnel management in terms of external factors were as follows.

Firstly, NIT education system focused on both theoretical and practical approaches through research method. It was the key to the teaching and learning system of NIT. This was an important part to create learning opportunities for all NIT's students.

Secondly, valuable networks both inside and outside the country included NIT's college and campus networks, NIT alumni networks, company and enterprise networks, and community networks.

Thirdly, the clear and transparent organizational structures and regulations and the explicit definition of personnel's roles and responsibilities influenced the success of NIT's personnel management.

### *Internal factors*

Internal factors influenced by the assessment criteria of the candidate's attitudes and appropriate qualifications affected the present characteristics of NIT's staff, namely, belief; value; discipline; dedication; willingness; loyalty; good relationship; and attitude toward problems solving.

## **Discussion**

Best practices and factors contributing to both internal and external successes of NIT were beneficial for Thai government. It could be applied as a guideline for the laws and regulations development of its teacher personnel administration system. The educational agencies, involving in the teachers' personnel administration of the institutions that conduct new teaching and learning approach, should study and review the results of the knowledge capturing in details before the implementing.

Due to the different social and cultural background between Japan and Thailand, however, it may take some times to create the specific characteristics of individuals which must be cultivated since childhood. Thus, the involvement of OBEC is

required in properly preparing people for the new education system in specific educational institutes.

This leads to a discussion of the synthesis results regarding the best practices and the factors contributing to the success of NIT's personnel management. It may build a clearer understanding of system development and laws and regulations improvement in order to solve the problems in the educational institutes that conduct new educational system in Thailand.

The findings showed that NIT's recruitment system focusing on significant standards setting in personnel management system influenced the success of NIT, one of Japan's leading human resource management institutes. It also indicated the main practices of NIT's recruitment system, namely, recruiting criteria and lecturers' specifications. NIT's educational background included its reputation, publications, and invaluable characteristics or value system, namely, interest; attitude; vision; a belief. In addition, NIT had also set up other consistent systems, namely, incentives system for retention. It consisted of the incentives in development and incentives on payment such as research grants, benefits, and welfares.

Why do educational background and interests of NIT applicants that were set up as main NIT's lecturer specification influenced the achievement of NIT's personnel management? The answer related to many previous studies on Japan identity and importance of recruitment system. Japanese society values achievement and success and expects the quality of education (Hofstede, 1981; Hofstede, 1991) while NIT has to meet the challenge of domestic and international competition in research. Thus, to successfully run NIT's new trend of education system which emphasizes quality research works, NIT needs to recruit qualified people into its system. Ph.D. is the right answer for setting up lecturers' specification on NIT lecturers' educational background. Qualified lecturers with Ph.D. could serve those values and challenge as well as serve the students success both in furthering their education and job finding. This phenomenon confirmed by the statement of Barber, M., & Mourshed, M. (2007) that teachers' quality is one of the main factors that affect learners' quality.

Furthermore, Japanese society at large is more competitive (Hofstede, 1981; Hofstede, 1991). Thus, the unity of organization is dramatically important. Setting up lecturers' interest as one of the main specifications is a must. NIT right person must first hold the same interest in NIT education system, eager to teach and research, in good aspiration toward teaching NIT students, in a collaboration and cooperation with local companies to make the contribution due to the college duty, as well as be ready, willing, and able to support the community which is a key mission of NIT College.

In addition, with the support of a strong society in Japanese characteristic and Japanese shared value in unity and future-oriented (Khlanguwan, Y., 2003), a strong NIT community will eventually be created by these qualified lecturers. Accordingly, this phenomenon will enhance organization long-term success. This was confirmed by Orawongsuphathat, C. (2013) who indicated that the key to a successful organization is the person who meets the needs of the organization. This will be a valuable and important asset to drive the organization to achieve its goals and objectives. Unqualified personnel recruitment, selection, and placement resulted in unqualified staff and organization failure eventually (Heneman & Heneman, 1994).

Besides, internal factors that influenced NIT's achievement in personnel management had been revealed during the staff discussion and interview. They were staff's belief, value, loyalty, devotion, willingness, discipline, relationship, and attitude toward problems solving. Reviews on Japanese identity could explain this phenomenon. All these factors found to serve better NIT's organization culture influencing by national culture inheriting from Japanese culture and tradition in the past. They were formed inside their mind during the upbringing period. This was confirmed by studies on Japanese cultures, social order, tradition, and society (Khlanguwan, Y., 2003; Wray, H., 1999; Hofstede, 1981; Tsutsui, 1997; Hofstede, 1991).

Also, Japanese NIT staff's belief, value, and loyalty may influence by organization culture. The thinking of most Japanese tends to be intuitive and emotional (Nakamura, 1964). So NIT set up its shared motto, core values, and mission statements for their staff to hold on. When staff shared the same value and belief, they hold the unity of their NIT society. The more they maintain the unity, the more the society united and their loyalty was built. This strong sense of loyalty finally builds a strong society and

vice versa. Consequently, strong society served their courage and challenged them to compete with all tasks and focus on long-term success.

Since Japanese society is defined as a society of unity. Staff's devotion, willingness, and discipline occurred. They work to serve the organization and the nation. They devote themselves willingly and disciplinary focusing on the benefit of the public not the benefit of an individual (Wray, H. 1999).

Japanese people praise the strength of patience and perseverance, not from cleverness or deceit. In Japanese society, full action toward everything they do is the pride of the family (Tuntiruttanasoontorn, B., 2015).

In addition, most Japanese have a willingness to work hard and to persevere toward long-range goals. If a person is treated well, he works willingly and hard (Caudill, W., 1970). The culture of Japanese organization is a kind of father and son management – paternalism (Tsutsui, 1997). The close relationship between NIT staff was seen as a very distinctive and unique feature of Japanese organization management. It reflected traditional values of “groupism”. So, their attitude toward problems solving influenced by Japanese social order, the feeling of dependency, and high regard for harmony emphasizing collaborative unity and social order (Tsutsui, 1997).

Since the establishment of KOSEN, more than fifty years have passed and KOSEN has constantly been changing to meet the society's demands. The needs for teachers has also been changing to nurture professionals required for the society, thus, the flexible personnel management is required these days.

In summary, apart from the clear process of each best practice system, another thing that cannot be denied is the appropriate allocation of the budgets which enhances NIT success. NIT allocates funds such as development funds, research project grants, scholarships for presenting research results and academic publications both in and outside the country. It also allocates salary, welfare, special compensation, and benefits to all personnel regarding their potential and needs.

### ***Recommendations***

This report revealed useful information for Thai educational agencies in dealing with the problem of personnel management of teachers and qualification of teachers in specific educational institutes. The development of personnel management needs the cooperation and support from the main educational agencies such as the Office of Basic Education Commission, the Office of the Vocational Education Commission, and the Office of the Higher Education Commission.

The knowledge gained from this study should be used and applied to develop the standard of policies, requirements, rules, and regulations to be relevant, appropriate, and fair. Therefore, the recommendation for the development divided into 3 levels: national level; ministry level, and institute level as follows.

#### *National level*

In terms of the overall national policy, governments should encourage and promote global knowledge from the global community to form the national policies in the short and long term. It should provide the budgets for importing or exchanging knowledge among overseas experts or agencies in various fields in order to accommodate the rapid changes of the global society.

National development policy should focus on human resources development in order to produce high-quality human resources that serve national development policy. Therefore, all government sectors can understand the development trends and design their own plan which serves the country development regarding the following areas.

1. Body of knowledge building area - Governments should promote and cooperate with the world community to study the development trends of the world leading countries to bring global knowledge to serve as a basis for determining the policy of the country in both short and long term.

2. Budget provision area – The government should provide the budget for importing or exchanging knowledge with experts or agencies abroad in various fields such as education, trading, industry, agriculture, and technology. Therefore, major state agencies will be able to adjust themselves to the rapid changes in the global society.



3. Human resources development area – The governments should promote and support new educational systems review, improvement, or development at all levels. Therefore, the institutes are able to produce high-quality human resources to serve the need for national development.

*Ministry level*

In terms of the overall ministry policy, the Ministry of Education should revise the policy, rules, and regulations relating to personnel management of teacher civil servants in the institutes that conduct both regular and specific educational systems. The policies, requirements, rules, and regulations must be standard, relevant, appropriate, and fair. The Ministry of Education must also seek cooperation among both domestic and overseas educational agencies and private sectors to serve the country's development policy in the following areas.

1. Policies, requirements, rules, and regulations area – the Ministry of Education should revise the structure, rules, and regulations relating to personnel administration of the whole main systems in government offices. The main systems are recruitment system, recruitment system for promotion, value system, and incentive systems for retention. It is to sustainably motivate all personnel and to maintain quality lecturers. The operations suggested are as follows.

1.1 The Ministry of Education should support the development of policies, rules, and regulations regarding the system of teachers' personnel administration in educational institutes, especially in the institutes that conduct new teaching and learning approach.

1) To review the policy regarding the formulation, development, and improvement of rules and regulations, laws and regulations relating to teachers' personnel administration in educational institutes that provide various educational and instructional systems.

2) To review the structure of personnel management of educational institutes that conduct various educational systems to ensure transparency, modernity and universality every year.

2.1) Restructure the authority section by dividing into two parts: academic and management.

2.2) Implement all authority in the form of a commission

2.3) Build networks among all sectors in and outside the country in order to promote and support the operation, administration, human resources, budgets, and knowledge in every level. Government sector network may involve schools, higher education institutes, organizations, or other institutes and ministries. Private sector network may involve alumni, an association of companies, private research center.

3) To review, develop and improve the quality and standards of rules and regulations including the follow-up and monitoring measurement regarding teachers' personnel management in the institutes that conduct both regular and specific systems every year. In addition, a self-assessment unit may require.

4) To review, develop, and improve the rules, regulations, and teachers' administrative procedures for the consistency throughout the system. The main sub-systems that require the review are producing system, recruitment system, development system, salary and welfare system, and retention system. This requires the involvement of the main educational organization such as the Office of the Permanent Secretary, the Office of the Basic Education Commission, the relevant educational institutes, the Office of the Higher Education Commission, and the Office of the Vocational Education Commission.

1.2 The Ministry of Education should support the development of policies, rules, regulations of the recruitment system and teachers' qualifications, especially in the institutes that conduct specific educational system. This requires the involvement of the main educational organization such as the Office of the Permanent Secretary, the Office of the Basic Education Commission, the relevant educational institutes, the Office of the Higher Education Commission, and the Office of the Vocational Education Commission. Additionally, the cooperation of other sectors such as the Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Science and Technology, Ministry of Industry including the private sector, such as companies or enterprises is required.

1) Set up quality standard for government teachers or instructors in each institute especially the ones that conduct specific educational system which serve the needs and satisfaction of the institutes and their personnel.

1.1) Set the educational background and academic publication as one of the key standards. The requirement for educational background is 1) bachelor and master degree with good academic performance and achievement or 2) teaching or working experiences in related fields 3) reputation and 4) highly skilled in basic, specific, and other special skills. This requires the consideration of both theoretical and practical quality. Ph.D. graduates from certified institutes in and outside the country are considered as preferable candidates. They have greater knowledge especially in research methodology to serve the improvement of teaching and learning quality.

1.2) Set the personal attributes such as interest, attitudes, vision, and belief as well as the overall appropriateness to the institutes' educational system as one of the important standards.

1.3) Set the publications such as academic research as one of the key standards. The publications may be an article published in the peer-reviewed journal domestically and internationally, published textbook, innovative, patent, books, inventions and designed products, research work presented at the conference, and other reputations.

1.4) Qualified applicants may be recruited for part-time teaching.

1.5) Foreign teachers are eligible to be recruited for the institutes that conduct specific educational system.

2) Review the process, procedures, and criteria in the recruitment system of all institutes for a clear, transparent, fair, free of interference to serve the needs of the institutes and satisfy most personnel.

3) Develop the process, procedures, and criteria for personnel selecting in accordance with the defined quality standards to create effective, transparent, fair, and universal selection standard which serve the needs of the institutes.

3.1) The process and procedures will be divided into two sections: qualification and documentation screening; and an interview, presentation and testing

3.2) Essay must be provided to represent their knowledge, ability, vision, attitude, and interests and be presented in front of the board of judges.

3.3) Criteria for selection include 1) attitudes (interest, knowledge, value, education, organizational loyalty; 2) knowledge, skills, and abilities; and 3) appropriate qualifications to be a teacher of the institutes, all criteria contain the same weight of scoring.

4) Review the structure, roles, and responsibilities of teachers in both regular and specific institutes and develop for clear details to serve the needs of the institutes. Besides, the distribution of the details in order to make mutual understanding and recognition for the unity of the work is required.

5) Determine quality standards, selectors and / or evaluators to create an effective, transparent, fair, and universal atmosphere and serve the requirements of teachers recruiting.

1.3 Ministry of Education should support the formulation of policies, rules, regulations, promotion, and payment systems including incentive systems for teachers in both regular and specific institutes.

1) Overall perspectives of performance assessment for position promotion such as the top-down, the bottom-up, the peers to peers, and the self-assessment is required. The evaluation list consists of two parts: achievement in teaching and achievement in management.

2) Establish monitoring and evaluation standards for the performance appraisal of the promoted teachers' which based on government quality standards.

3) Define standardized treatment criteria which may be done in the form of a quality assurance organization.

4) Set up the quality standards of the evaluators with the same standard, no transparency, and no interference characteristics.

5) Review, develop, and improve policies, rules, regulations regarding budget allocation for development such as project grants, research scholarships, and grants for research presenting and academic publications both in and outside the country, which serve the educational system and the needs of the institutes.

6) Review, develop, and improve policies, rules, regulations, budget allocation, welfare, special remuneration, and benefits for teachers in both regular and specific institutes every year. This must be consistent with the quality standard and potential of the required teachers in order to convince, motivate, and maintain the high quality and potential human resources which affect the institutes' teaching and learning achievement.

2. Cooperation seeking for resources mobilization area - The Ministry of Education should set up the policies to encourage and support the institutes to seek cooperation and network the country in various areas both in and outside. The budget should be provided and allocated for the mobilization of all kind resources and collaborative knowledge and networks. This will lead to the development of the teaching and learning quality, teachers' quality, and learners' quality.

*Institute level*

The institutes should conduct the following actions.

1. Evaluate the quality of institutes' educational system and educational management and report to the Ministry of Education in order to apply as a guideline for educational development policies and strategies setting.

2. Evaluate the quality of the teachers' personnel administration system in both regular and specific institutes and report to the Minister in order to apply in a policy and strategies formulation and development guideline. It requires the consistency of the policy and strategies and the needs of the institutes. The formulation and development may include the reviewing of institutes' administration structure for its transparency and fair system, appropriate teachers' qualifications that serve the needs of the institutes, and needs of recruiting for teachers with quality and diversity that serve the achievement in building excellence students in various fields. Additionally, the determining of salary level, compensation, benefits, as well as grants and budget allocation for development is required. Accordingly, the roles, duties, and responsibilities of the teachers must be clear.

3. Provide the acquired knowledge into practice. Technical colleges have classes in which the students work on projects which were very nice approach. At the same time, there are strong needs to enhance the level of “Monozukuri” (practical skills).

4. It is necessary to enhance English communication skills of Technical college teachers.

### ***Recommendations for future study***

Knowledge gained from this study regarding NIT best practices in recruiting system and lecturers’ specification can be used as a basis for further research and supportive information for improving and developing the personnel administration of Thai teachers.

1. The best practices should be explored - especially in recruiting, selection, and personnel placement in educational institutes or in other countries that conduct new teaching and learning approach, special education, or bilateral education – to investigate the feasibility of the application.

2. The best practices in each teacher personnel management process should be explored in other topics related to recruitment, selection, and personnel placement, such as teachers’ development, teachers’ salary, compensation and welfares, and quality teachers maintaining in the organization especially in the institutes that conduct new teaching and learning system.

3. Comparison study of recruitment, selection, and personnel placement processes should be conducted to investigate the feasibility of the application.

4. Comparison study of other related personnel management processes such as personnel development, salary and compensation, and quality teachers maintaining should be conducted to investigate the differences among other foreign countries as well as the feasibility of the application.

5. Survey study would be expected from the view point of historical context since this protocol has been developed in 60years KOSEN history. Thus, if situation changes, the system will be changed.

6. The study of personnel treatment and recruitment system to employ qualified lecturers should be established so that we can keep the high quality of education.